

sulla trad. di Teodoro di Gaza, cfr. i
annotazioni GM, lett. n. 37, p. 183 sg.; n. 38
[in altre che non ho pubbl. ???] cfr. quel passo de c'ta
che è confrontato con
quanto aveva a disposizione?

Greek Text and Latin Translations of the Aristotelian *Musical Problems*: A Preliminary Account of the Sources

F. ALBERTO GALLO

As is well known, the *Problems* (Προβλήματα) are an ample collection of questions and responses on various scientific subjects,¹ which today are commonly attributed in part to Aristotle himself and in part to his school.² Of the thirty-eight sections into which the work is generally subdivided, the eleventh section, "Concerning Sound" ("Ὅσα περὶ φωνῆς"),³ and the nineteenth section, "Concerning Harmony" ("Ὅσα περὶ ἁρμονίας"),⁴ treat questions of musical theory and of musical practice.

Although the original compilation might be traceable back as far as the third century B.C., the actual known text is that copied during the tenth century in Byzantine circles, and of which there remains direct testimony.⁵ From here derives substantially the whole manuscript tradi-

¹The first critical edition is *Aristotelis opera*, ed. Immanuel Bekker (Berlin: G. Reimerum, 1831-1870), II: 859-967. The current edition is *Aristotelis Problemata physica*, ed. Charles Emile Ruelle, Hans Knoellinger, Joseph Klek (Leipzig: Teubner, 1922).

²Edward S. Forster, "The Pseudo-Aristotelian Problems: Their Nature and Composition," *Classical Quarterly* 22 (1929): 163-179; Gerardo Marengi, "Per una identificazione e collocazione storica del fondo aristotelico dei *Problemata physica*," *Maia* 13 (1961): 34-50.

³Greek text and Italian translation in Aristotle, *Problemi di fonazione e di acustica*, ed. Gerardo Marengi (Naples: Libreria scientifica editrice, 1962). See also Gerardo Marengi, "I problemi della φωνή nella Ἐπιτομή φυσικῶν," *Bollettino dei classici* 29 (1981): 166-183.

⁴Greek text and Italian translation in Aristotle, *Problemi musicali*, ed. Gerardo Marengi (Florence: Sansoni, 1957).

⁵MS Paris, BN gr. 2036. Gerardo Marengi, "La tradizione manoscritta dei *problemata physica aristotelici*," *Bollettino del comitato per la preparazione della*

tion, which consists of over forty examples,⁶ all from considerably later periods. There exist a single thirteenth-century copy, some fourteenth-century copies, and many copies from the fifteenth century, among which some belonged to illustrious collectors such as Cardinal Bessarion (MSS Venezia, BNM gr. 216 and gr. 259) or to renowned scholars such as Giorgio Valla (MS Modena, Biblioteca Estense, gr. 155). In 1499, the first print of the Greek text, edited by Aldo Manuzio, was published in Venice. Nevertheless, the work continued to be copied in the sixteenth and even seventeenth centuries, either from manuscripts or from the printed text.

Because knowledge of the Greek language was extremely rare during the Middle Ages, the primary dissemination of the Aristotelian text took place by means of translations. We have only indirect evidence of a translation into Arabic⁷ as well as a translation from Arabic into Latin in the work of Michael Scot (ca. 1230).⁸ The primary vehicle for the dissemination of the *Problems*, however, was the Latin translation by Bartolomeo da Messina. According to precise testimony, Bartolomeo executed the translation at the court of Manfredi, son of Federico II, then in southern Italy between 1258 and 1266.⁹ About fifty copies,¹⁰ some executed already in the thirteenth century and a greater number during the fourteenth century, attest that this translation was known practically throughout Europe and in circles quite diverse: from the faculty of theology at the Sorbonne (MS Paris, BN lat. 16633) to the court of Charles of Orléans (MS Paris BN lat. 6307).

⁶André Wartelle, *Inventaire des manuscrits grecs d'Aristote et des ses commentaires* (Paris: Société d'Édition «Les Belles Lettres», 1963). Paul Moraux, *Aristoteles graecus. Die griechischen Manuskripte des Aristoteles*, vol 1: Alexandrien-London (Berlin: De Gruyter, 1976).

⁷Henry George Farmer, *The Sources of Arabian Music* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1965), p. 14.

⁸Paul Renucci, *L'aventure de l'humanisme européen au moyen âge (IV^e - XIV^e siècle)* (Paris: Société d'Édition «Les Belles Lettres», 1953), p. 80.

⁹MS Padova, Biblioteca Antoniana, XVII 370. See Ezio Franceschini, "Le traduzioni latine aristoteliche e pseudoaristoteliche del codice antoniano XVII 370," *Aevum* 9 (1935): 3-26, and Gerardo Marengi, "Un capitolo dell'Aristotele medievale: Bartolomeo da Messina traduttore dei *Problemata physica*," *Aevum* 36 (1962): 268-283.

¹⁰*Aristoteles latinus*, vol. I, ed. George Lacombe (Rome: La Libreria dello Stato: 1939; repr. Bruges-Paris: Desclée De Brouwer, 1957), vol. II, ed. George Lacombe and Lorenzo Minio-Paluello (Cambridge: Typis Academiae, 1955), vol. III, ed. Lorenzo Minio-Paluello (Bruges-Paris: Desclée De Brouwer, 1961), s.v. "Problemata"

With regard to the fortune of the musical arguments treated in the *Problems*, it should be mentioned that Engelbert of Admont cites the Latin translation of two passages from the nineteenth section in his musical treatise.¹¹ The same nineteenth section in Bartolomeo's translation is copied in a codex of musical theory written probably in Bologna between the end of the thirteenth and the beginning of the fourteenth centuries.¹² As limited as the reception of the *Problems* might have been both on the part of the writer of musical treatises and in musical circles in general, the translation of Bartolomeo da Messina, by revealing the contents of the eleventh¹³ and nineteenth sections, transmitted to general cultural knowledge an extensive series of musical arguments. Not to be overlooked, moreover, is the fact that these two sections of the *Problems* were the only two Greek texts of musical theory to be translated into Latin during the Middle Ages.¹⁴

Although widely circulated in manuscript as well as printed many times between the end of the fifteenth and the beginning of the sixteenth centuries, the literal translation of Bartolomeo da Messina¹⁵ was not able to satisfy the new philological and stylistic exigencies of more scholarly sectors of *quattrocento* culture. In 1452 at the request of Pope Nicholas V, George of Trebisonde executed a new translation of the *Problems*.¹⁶ It breaks off at the thirty-third section because the

¹¹Gerbert, II: 300a and 341a.

¹²MS Pesaro, Biblioteca Oliveriana, 1336. See Michel Huglo, "Il manoscritto 1336 della Biblioteca Oliveriana di Pesaro," *Rivista italiana di musicologia* 9 (1974): 20-36.

¹³The translation of this section by Bartolomeo da Messina is given in Aristotle, *Problemi di fonazione*, ed. Marengi, pp. 105-117.

¹⁴F. Alberto Gallo, "Die Kenntnis der griechischen Theoretikerquellen in der italienischen Renaissance," *Geschichte der Musiktheorie*, VII (Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1989), pp. 9-13.

¹⁵Regarding the activity of Bartolomeo as translator, see also: Rudolf Seligsohn, *Die Uebersetzung der pseudo-aristotelischen Problemata durch Bartholomaeus von Messina* (Berlin: E. Ebering, 1934); Aristotle, *Problemi di medicina*, ed. Gerardo Marengi (Milan: Istituto Editoriale Italiano, 1966); Luciano Venturini, "La traduzione latina di Bartolomeo da Messina del *De mirabilibus* dello Pseudo Aristotele (dal cod. Patav. Antoniano XVII 370)," *Atti e memorie dell'Accademia Patavina di scienze, lettere ed arti, classe di scienze morali, lettere et arti* 88, 3 (1975-1976): 69-77.

¹⁶John Monfasani, *George of Trebisonde. A Biography and a Study of His Rhetoric and Logic* (Leiden: Brill, 1976), pp. 73-78, 150-156. *Collectanea Trapezuntiana. Texts, Documents, and Bibliographies of George of Trebisonde*, ed. John Monfasani (Binghamton, New York: Center for Medieval and Renaissance

fine XIII -
inizio XIV
sec.

1491;
in off. mss
AR. Pol. VII

2

3 — Greek exemplar furnished by Cardinal Bessarion was incomplete.¹⁷ After George of Trebisonde had fallen from favor, Nicholas V, again with the intervention of Bessarion, charged Teodoro Gaza with the preparation of another Latin translation of the *Problems*, which was executed between 1452 and 1454.¹⁸ This translation enjoyed particularly good fortune; it was printed for the first time in Mantua in 1473, and reprinted innumerable times during the following centuries until the nineteenth century.¹⁹ The two translations of Trebisonde and of Gaza, although contemporaneous, were undertaken according to very different criteria, with one seeking to represent the original text and the other striving for stylistic modernity. Thus they gave rise to a polemical pamphlet by Trebisonde against Gaza.²⁰ Neither of the two new translations, however, seem to have had any echo in the musical world.

→ The widespread knowledge of the Aristotelian doctrine of the *Problems* promoted by the translations also gave rise, particularly in medieval times, to a whole series of studies on the text itself. There were elaborations, abbreviations, glosses, and above all commentaries, through which various generations of readers used and interpreted the ancient collection, making the entire work as well as the musical sections their own. But of these matters it will be necessary to give a detailed account on another occasion.

(translated by André Barbera)

¹⁷The translation of the eleventh section by George of Trebisonde is given in Aristotle, *Problemi di fonazione*, ed. Marengi, pp. 123–135.

¹⁸Monfasani, *George of Trebisonde*, p. 150, n. 79.

¹⁹It was inserted in *Aristotelis opera*, ed. Bekker, III: 415–474.

²⁰Published by Ludwig Mohler, *Kardinal Bessarion als Theologe, Humanist und Staatsmann* (Paderborn: F. Schöningh, 1923–1942; repr., Paderborn: Scientia-Verlag, 1967), III: 277–342.

Paris, BN lat. 16633 (13th c.)
 Pesaro, Biblioteca Oliveriana, 1336 (13th-14th c.)
 Praha, Státní Knihovna, IV. D. 6 (13th-14th c.)
 Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque Municipale, 598 (13th-14th c.)
 Valencia, Biblioteca del Cabildo, 236 (14th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV lat. 2112 (14th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV lat. 2176 (14th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV lat. 2993 (14th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV lat. 3007 (14th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV Borgh. 37 (14th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV Chig. G V 131 (13th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV Ottob. 2083 (14th c.)
 Vendôme, Bibliothèque Municipale, 111 (14th c.)
 Venezia, BNM lat. VI.43 (= 2488) (14th c.)
 Venezia, BNM lat. VI.44 (= 2846) (14th c.)
 Wien, ÖN cpv 125 (13th c.)
 Wien, ÖN cpv 2416 (14th c.)

George of Trebisond

Firenze, BML pl. 89.84 (15th c.)
 London, BL add. 21978 (1477)
 Milano, BA D 111 sup. (15th c.)
 Milano, BA L 84 sup. (1455)
 Oxford, BL Canon. class. lat. 164 (15th c.)
 Oxford, Corpus Christi College D 105 (15th c.)
 Paris, BN lat. 6328 (15th c.)
 Sevilla, Biblioteca Capitular y Colombina, 83.2.7 (15th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV lat. 5790 (15th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV Urb. lat. 1322 (15th c.)

Teodoro Gaza

Barcelona, Biblioteca Universitaria y Provincial, 580 (15th c.)
 Copenhagen, Det Kongelige Bibliotek, Ny kgl. S. 44 b 2^o (15th c.)
 Dresden, Sachsische Landesbibliothek, Db 80 (15th c.)
 Firenze, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Magliabechianus XII.49 (15th c.)
 London, BL add. 21978 (1477)
 London, BL Harley 2584 (15th c.)
 Milano, BA A 249 inf. (15th c.)
 Milano, BA D 195 inf. (16th c.)
 Milano, BA Q 46 sup. (15th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV lat. 2111 (15th c.)
 Vaticano, BAV Pal. lat. 1065 (15th c.)